

Message

From: Szelag, Matthew [Szelag.Matthew@epa.gov]
Sent: 8/24/2020 4:40:04 PM
To: Opalski, Dan [Opalski.Dan@epa.gov]; Baca, Andrew [Baca.Andrew@epa.gov]
CC: Grandinetti, Cami [Grandinetti.Cami@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Messages from the public on Pebble Mine

Flag: Follow up

FYI – see the summary below.

Matthew Szelag | Water Quality Standards Coordinator
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency | Region 10
222 W 7th Avenue, #19 | Anchorage, AK 99513
P: (907) 271.1208 | szelag.matthew@epa.gov

From: Lindsay, Andrea <Lindsay.Andrea@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, August 21, 2020 7:51 AM
To: Holsman, Marianne <Holsman.Marianne@epa.gov>
Cc: Fraser, Michelle <Fraser.michelle@epa.gov>; Szelag, Matthew <Szelag.Matthew@epa.gov>; Skadowski, Suzanne <Skadowski.Suzanne@epa.gov>
Subject: Messages from the public on Pebble Mine

Hello, Marianne. Here is an update about incoming correspondence related to Pebble Mine. Since my last update to you on August 3 (below), we have received the following messages urging EPA to “veto” the Pebble Mine. We have received no correspondence in favor of Pebble Mine during this time. -andi

41 individual, independent emails
27 voice mail messages
558 “form letter” emails – see content below
28,030 - A spreadsheet containing comments of 28,030 supporters of Audubon, 2,019 of which are personalized – see content below

FROM NATIONAL AUDUBON SOCIETY/Alaska

Dear Mr. Hladick,

Please find attached an Excel spreadsheet (.xlsx) containing the comments of 28,030 supporters of the National Audubon Society in response to the Army Corps' Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) for the Pebble Mine project, urging the EPA to use its authority under the Clean Water Act to veto the Pebble Mine permit. Please note, many people submitted personalized comments (2,019), which can be found on the first tab of the worksheet; others sent or signed on to the comments below:

Alaska's Bristol Bay is the migratory crossroads for birds across the world. Nowhere else on Earth is more important for so many birds from so many continents. It is also perhaps the world's most important salmon region. But the proposed Pebble Mine would dig an enormous mining pit in the heart of spawning salmon and breeding bird habitat. I am writing to urge you to use EPA's authority under the Clean Water Act to veto the mine permit.

When Congress passed the Clean Water Act, it created the 404(c) provision to protect outstanding natural resources like Bristol Bay, which is the heart of Alaska's growing tourism economy. The industry relies on the intact ecosystems and rich wildlife diversity to bring thousands of visitors to the region each year to fish, view brown bears, hunt, and recreate on national park and state park lands. Plus, more than 40% of the salmon consumed in the U.S. comes from Bristol Bay, making it a huge economic engine for Alaska with a \$1.5 billion fishing economy and over 14,000 jobs.

The Army Corps' Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) for Pebble Mine disregards years of EPA led peer-reviewed science and accumulated knowledge on Bristol Bay. The 20-year mine plan, which will destroy over 3,500 acres

of wetlands, lakes, and ponds, and over 80 miles of salmon streams, far exceeds what EPA already determined in 2014 posed "unacceptable" impacts to Bristol Bay.

Please protect the vibrant and vital ecosystem of Bristol Bay with a 404(c) "veto."

Sincerely, Rebecca Sentner

Sr. Communications Manager, Audubon Alaska

FORM LETTER RECEIVED FROM 558 INDIVIDUALS

Dear Region 10 Administrator Hladick,

I am writing to express my concerns regarding the Pebble Mine and to ask that you veto their application.

The waters of Bristol Bay are home to the world's most important wild sockeye salmon fishery. That fishery supplies nearly half of the world's sockeye salmon, supports more than 14,000 fishing jobs, and generates over \$1.5 billion of economic activity every year. Pebble Mine poses massive risks to Alaska's Bristol Bay watershed, its world-renowned salmon runs and its Native communities.

Your agency has repeatedly underscored the risks Pebble poses to Bristol Bay and the science that supports protecting this vital American resource. You wrote that the development of Pebble Mine would likely result in the "permanent loss of 2,292 acres of wetlands" and "hundreds of miles of streams." If fully developed, it will also poison the headwaters of Bristol Bay with up to 10.2 billion tons of toxic mining waste that must be stored forever behind large dams in the heart of a seismically active region. Damage from even minor leakage could be catastrophic for local people and the American fishing economy. I strongly encourage the EPA to intercede in a meaningful way to prevent such a catastrophe from happening.

Senators Murkowski and Sullivan have both expressed concern about Pebble Mine and helped pass legislation in the United State Congress last year that encourages the EPA to use its "enforcement authority under the Clean Water Act...at an appropriate time." That time is now.

The EPA has the responsibility under the Clean Water Act to protect the Bristol Bay watershed. I urge you to veto the Pebble Mine and protect this fishery, its communities and economy.

Sincerely,

[each submittal signed individually]

Andrea Lindsay | **Community Involvement Coordinator** | **EPA Region 10**
lindsay.andrea@epa.gov | 206-553-1896 | 800-424-4372 x1896 | Work Days: Mondays, Thursdays, Fridays
1200 Sixth Avenue, Suite 155, 12-D12, Seattle, WA 98101

From: Lindsay, Andrea

Sent: Monday, August 03, 2020 9:26 AM

To: Holsman, Marianne <Holsman.Marianne@epa.gov>

Cc: Szelag, Matthew <Szelag.Matthew@epa.gov>

Subject: Select messages from public on Pebble Mine

Marianne, as we discussed, I am sending you select messages we have received from the public over the past month related to the Pebble Mine.

1. Attached are 5 representative voicemail messages. These are short. Of the approximately 60 voicemails we've received in the past month, only one was not opposed (neutral) to Pebble Mine.
2. Below is a compilation of 4 representative emails we have received from the public over the past month. Of the 15 emails we received since July 1, one has been in support of the mine.

Lynne Bonetti **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)** The final environmental review resulted in questionable science and dubious results which were criticized by independent scientists, federal agencies, and Bristol Bay community leaders. The initial 20-year mine plan would destroy over 2,300 acres of wetlands and more than 105 miles of salmon streams, far exceeding the standards that the Environmental Protection Agency set in 2014 for "unacceptable" impacts. It's time for the EPA to step in and veto this mine. Thank you.

Michael S. Ellegood, P.E. **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)** I am concerned that the Corps of Engineers has reportedly approved the EIS for the proposed Pebble Mine. This mine is located in an environmentally sensitive and very remote area. Though now retired, I am a professional Civil Engineer and, in my 60-year career, have both regulated mining operations and been peripherally involved in their cleanup. I have yet to see a responsible mining operation that follows the rules (especially when no one is watching) and remains environmentally conscious throughout the mining operation. The remote location of Bristol Bay and the proposed mine site will make government oversight problematic at best. Please use whatever process is appropriate to deny this permit.

Sarah and Glenn Lane **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)** Dear EPA, The idea of a mine in this productive salmon watershed is ludicrous, greedy, and insane. Salmon create many more thousands of jobs and dollars for our economy. Salmon are a keystone for the humans and animals alike. A whole, clean watershed is what will sustain these things. Check out the book, "The King of Salmon". As Europeans moved west through Europe, UK, to the US, east coast, and westward and north, they left behind a path of ruined fisheries. Do not choose to ignore the past. Do not ruin this one too. Proponents of the project may say there is no danger of leakage or contamination, but the past says otherwise. Greed is driving this project. Private profit for a few is not a justification for endangering this amazing and beautiful salmon home. NO Pebble Mine!!!!

Deb Lawless **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)** I am writing again to ask for your help on an issue that threatens American jobs and outdoor traditions, not to mention the last and largest intact salmon run in the world. I continue to be extremely concerned about the massive open-pit gold and copper mine that a Canadian mining company is proposing to build in the Bristol Bay region of Alaska. The efforts to develop the massive mine in this unique area threaten more than 14,000 American jobs, a fishery worth more than \$1.5 billion dollars annually and a sport fishing and hunting paradise. It is considered a world-class fishing destination. We have collectively decimated salmon runs almost everywhere else on the planet- can we not leave one alone to thrive as it was meant to be?? The EPA has identified the risks of this mine if built - including the decimation of many miles of streams and storing up to 10 billion tons of mine waste without accident (ha!) behind earthen dams, forever (why would this project be successful when history shows us these dams will fail?). The mine is, and has been, relentlessly opposed by most Alaskans, as well as anglers, hunters and other outdoor recreation enthusiasts from around the country, including me. Preventing this mine from moving forward would protect American jobs, safeguard the culture of native and rural America, and ensure that our national outdoor heritage prospers - not to mention the enduring survival of one of the most important partners in our unique PNW ecosystem. Despite other distractions, we are still paying attention to this deeply critical issue, and we expect the environmental PROTECTION agency to actually PROTECT the environment. Please do what the American public has entrusted you to do, and has communicated loudly and repeatedly what outcome they would like - PROTECT the environment. Thank you for listening and for your attention to this matter at this urgent time.

Andrea Lindsay | Community Involvement Coordinator | EPA Region 10
lindsay.andrea@epa.gov | 206-553-1896 | 800-424-4372 x1896 | Work Days: Mondays, Thursdays, Fridays
1200 Sixth Avenue, Suite 155, 12-D12, Seattle, WA 98101
